

VI International Forum on Teacher Education

Aspects of the Cultural Identity of Russian and Tatar Literatures as a Factor of Education of Language Teachers for Bilingual Schools of the Republic of Tatarstan

Alsu Z. Khabibullina* (a), Elvira F. Nagumanova (b), Oksana V. Shemshurenko
(c)

(a), (b), (c) Kazan Federal University, 420008, Kazan (Russia), 18 Kremlyovskaya street,
alsu_zarifovna@mail.ru

Abstract

Consideration of various aspects of cultural identity occupies a special place in the education of language teachers for bi- and multilingual schools of the Republic of Tatarstan. In the context of globalization, the relevance of the study is associated with the necessity of a future teacher's personality formation in the light of the tolerance to the world of a "different" artistic consciousness and language.

The purpose of the article is to identify the foundations of the cultural identity of Russian and Tatar literature, its various forms of representation as a factor in the future language education of teachers in the Republic of Tatarstan.

A scientific experiment based on the poem of Tufan "The Winds are Blowing" was conducted among bilingual students of philology. It is established that the cultural and literary identity of the readers affects the reception of genre content and form of the work.

The conclusion is that the awareness of future teachers of "their" identity becomes the most important task of their education and the realization of pedagogical potential. It is established that mastering the phenomenon of identity leads to a better understanding of the principle of cultural identity in a multi-ethnic environment, as well as the development of a future teacher's personality, being ready for communication in the context of a multiplicity of artistic traditions and languages.

Keywords: cultural identity, comparison of literatures, a language teacher, bi- and multilingual schools, the principle of cultural conformity, national literatures.

© 2020 Alsu Z. Khabibullina, Elvira F. Nagumanova, Oksana V. Shemshurenko

This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY 4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Published by Kazan federal university and peer-reviewed under responsibility of IFTE-2020 (VI International Forum on Teacher Education)

* Corresponding author. E-mail: alsu_zarifovna@mail.ru

Introduction

Relevance

In the context of globalization of modern society, the study of the plurality of cultures, languages, and literatures is of great importance. In this context, consideration of Russian and Tatar literatures' cultural identity in language teachers' education is gaining its value: it allows, on the one hand, a better understanding of the two cultures' interaction, on the other hand, to develop tolerance and a sense of respect for the "alien". The latter takes place both in the professional training system of future teachers, as well as in the process of teaching students in schools of the Republic of Tatarstan, where *cultural multiplicity* is one of the forms of its peoples' spiritual life.

Nowadays, various aspects of the problem of cultural identity are considered in modern philology in general. The study of this phenomenon, different types of identity (ethnonational identity, hybrid identity, transcultural identity) and the features of its representation in the literature takes place in the pedagogical training of philological students of the Kazan Federal University. Thus, the phenomenon of identity becomes the most controversial one for Russian and Tatar philologists while studying modern Russian-language literature as a part of "Literature of the Peoples of Russia". We are talking about the famous works of Yakhina ("Zuleikha opens her eyes", "My Children"), Abuzyarov ("Kurban-Roman"), Idiatullina ("Ubyr"). Their consideration in the light of issues of cultural identity, promotes intercultural dialogue, and also forms discussions among students on the role of language in the artistic recreation of the national character and the "image of the worldview" of the Tatars (Ibragimov, 2018). In addition, philology students who are focused on future pedagogical activity, through an analysis of the phenomenon of Russian-language literature itself, can easily master the renovation trends that characterize both the spiritual world of the Tatar people at the beginning of the 21st century and the life of Russian national literature in general (Kolyadich, 2019.).

Thus, the purpose of this article is to study the foundations of Russian and Tatar literatures' cultural identity and its various forms as a factor in education of future language teachers in the multi-ethnic educational environment of the Republic of Tatarstan.

Current trends and basic terms

1.1. The phenomenon of identity occupies a special place in education of future language teachers for bi- and multilingual schools of the Republic of Tatarstan. Understanding its nature and sources of origin allows, on the one hand, to better see into the work of national writers who identify themselves with the

Tatar culture and Kazan. On the other hand, it provides an opportunity to understand the features of the “alien”, including the “borderline” artistic consciousness in the context of different types of cultures and languages. Understanding the nature of identity brings students — future educators and language teachers — to the problems of dialogue of literatures and their comparison. According to M.M. Bakhtin, “a foreign culture only in the eyes of a different culture reveals itself more fully and deeper ... <...> One meaning reveals its depths, having encountered with the other, alien, meaning: a dialogue begins between them, which overcomes the isolation and one-sidedness of these meanings, of these cultures” (Bakhtin, 1986, p. 334-335).

1.2. The problem of cultural identity in literature increases while the works of Russian writers are being studied by migrant students as carriers of “different” values. The study of identity nature in literature made by future language teachers contributes to a better development of the principle of cultural conformity and the development of the methodological techniques to overcome the problem of misunderstanding, which objectively arises in the foreign reception of Russian literature.

Let us consider the term “identity”. It should be noted that nowadays many scientific studies that have developed both in the field of ethnolinguistics, and philosophy and literary criticism are devoted to this term (Sultanov, 2007; Popov, 2004; Ibragimov, 2016). According to Popov, “a collective national identity is developed in the process of a nation’s self-reflection, during which it is not compared and / or identified, but compared and / or contrasted with other nations, and consists of the nation becoming aware of itself, recognizing itself as a nation with certain attributes” (Popov, 2004, p. 18).

Ibragimov wrote that “identity is a state of resemblance with the other, indivisibility with it when the boundary between “me” and “the others” disappears, that is what makes “me” and “the others” unified” (2013, p. 151). Moreover, the distinction between related terms - “identity” and “identification” is significant in the concept of identity. According to the researcher, they can be applied both to a literary work, its heroes, and to the reader himself as a participant in the receptive process (Ibragimov, 2013).

The concept of identity is the focus of many foreign scholars (Hall 1999; Wagner 2002; Brubaker & Cooper, 2000). Their research focuses on the study of the problem of the individual and the collective (individual identity acquires social significance only with reference to the identities of others” (Hall, 1999, p.34), as well as self- identification of the individual in the modern world.

It is important to note that in literary criticism, identity is marked in many artistic forms, such as genre, rhyme and rhythm, as well as in the content of the work. Thus, cultural identity can fill the artistic images

and motives of works. In Russian literature, such texts include, for example, Goncharov's novel "Oblomov", where the character of the protagonist is largely "determined by the patriarchal way of life in Russia, which finds its embodiment in the poetry of Oblomovka, its correlation with the fairy-tale world through folklore illusions" (Ibragimov, 2016, p.10).

In Tatar literature, the features of cultural and national identity are revealed in the novels and short stories by Iskhaki ("The Beggar Girl"), Amirkhan "Hayat", Gilyazov "The Friday Night".

1.3. In literary criticism, the problem of signs (or markers) of cultural and national identity is discussed from a variety of perspectives. Among them, the stable point of view is that identity in literature should be studied in the aspect of comparative studies, and above all, a comparison of different literatures. This method is aimed at elucidating the uniqueness and originality of both an individual writer and the literature as a whole (Safiullin, 2010; Amineva, 2017; Sigov, 2019).

According to Safiullin: "Identity is the content and forms that distinguish one literature from another" (2010, p.29). In this aspect, Russian and Tatar literatures are unique and different, which should be compared in studies and not aligned (we are talking about a method of comparison) with each other. At the same time, the basis for differences in identity is the language in which literature exists and "forms of thinking typical of its carriers are fixed" (Safiullin, 2010).

Methodology

To achieve the aim, methods of modern comparative studies are used and the results of a scientific experiment on the reader's reception of foreign literature are summarized.

The comparative method in literary criticism is one of the methods of modern comparative studies that has developed in Russian literary criticism at the end of the 20th century. It is based on "preserving the uniqueness of each literature included in the research circle" (Safiullin, 2010, p.98).

The method of a scientific experiment aimed at studying the foreign perception of Russian and foreign classics. The KFU Institute of Philology and Intercultural Communication, where students of philology of pedagogical specialties are studying, has become the experimental base. They form a special bilingual environment at the university. It should be noted that during the training, philologists get acquainted with the works of their native literature and language, as well as the literature of the peoples of Russia.

A contrastive method is based on the search for a single (common) foundation in the works of multilingual authors.

The hermeneutic method, which involves the identification of “an endless renewal of meanings in ever new contexts” (Bakhtin, 1986).

Results

Genre as a factor in the national identity of Russian and Tatar literatures: an experimental study.

The *literary genre* is an identity's aspect mastered by philological students. In our study, we establish that each genre encloses a certain complex of ideas about a human being. It is fair to say, that the genre in different national literatures and languages retains its unique identity.

A similar thesis is proved by the experiment. Its actual basis is the poem of the 20th century Tatar poet Tufan “Жилләр исә” (“The Winds are Blowing”, 1957). The purpose of the experiment is to understand how the cultural and literary identities of the readers affect the perception of a foreign literary work, its genre; if there is any aesthetic interference in the reception of this poem[†].

The recipients had two questions they answered in written form:

1. What impression did Tufan's poem made on you? What is its ideological and psychological content?
2. What genre does it belong to?

The experiment involved 2 groups of readers, one of them consisting of the Tatar readers, represented by 29 philology students, future teachers of the Tatar language and literature. The experimental base of the study was the Department of National Culture and Education of the Institute of Philology and Intercultural Communication. For these students the Tatar language is native, therefore they have read and analyzed the poem in the original.

The second group consists of foreign readers: 32 philology students of the Department of Russian and Foreign philology, as well as future language teachers. Unlike Tatar readers, they perceived the work of Tufan in the form translated into Russian.

[†] Aesthetic interference is a phenomenon of foreign perception of literature. It represents a violation, a transformation of a work in the light of the national-artistic consciousness of the reader.

The results of the experiment

The study showed that the perception of the poem “The Winds are Blowing” by Tatar readers corresponded to the artistic experiences that created the conditions for the possible identification of the genre of this work as an *elegy*.

At the same time, another thing should be highlighted: an understanding of the content of Tufan's work, its main motives and images (the winds) did not come from the specific features of an elegy, but from these poetic genres that have developed in the circle of Tatar literary traditions. So, most of the answers (12) were aimed at the reception of the poem as one of the forms of "sincere lyrics" ("кыңел lyricasy"). In 4 responses, it was identified as a song; in 2 discussions, the genre of the poem was determined as a *neser*. The basis for the alignment of the work with *neser* (“prose in verses”) was, in their opinion, the presence of a longing motive (*sagynu motives*), which is most typical for this form.

And only in one (1) of the answers the elegy was mentioned, to which, according to the reader, the genre of the poem belongs.

We consider the appeal to spiritual lyrics in the thoughts of readers to be a nonrandom phenomenon: this kind of lyrical literature occupies a significant place in Tatar poetry of the 20th century. The study showed that Tatar readers, well understanding the traditions and characteristics of national lyrics, as well as relying on the facts of Tufan's biography, were able to subtly and sufficiently deeply reveal the ideological and psychological potential of the work. So, the image of the wind, from their point of view, symbolizes the freedom that the lyrical hero seeks, being in captivity (the motive of separation reveals the facts of Tufan's biography: the poet's exile, a forced separation from his beloved woman, family). These biographical representations served as the basis for correlating the poem with “sincere lyrics”.

In addition, according to some Tatar readers (6), the poem in its structure and rhythmic pattern corresponds to the poetics of folk songs, the lines of which Tufan put in the epigraph: *Isə җилләр isə җилләр. / Iskən җилләр faydasыз* (Winds are blowing, winds are blowing. / Blowing winds are useless) (Tufan, 1964, p. 214).

Let us single out the most interesting fragments of the discussions of the Tatar readers.

1. “This short poem by Tufan can be described in one sentence: the lyrical hero is lonely, he is waiting for the wind to bring news from his beloved. The pain of separation pierces his heart, he says that he has no one to share his feelings with. <...> It is necessary to note the epigraph to the poem. It says the blowing winds are useless. The lyrical hero turns to the wind, trying to find solace in it. <...>

The genre of the poem is sincere lyrics. The work does not have a lyrical plot, the main thing is the expression of the hero's personal experiences and hopes".

2. "... Since the poem [its contents] and the life of Tufan coincide, it can be stated that this is an autobiographical work, where the poet describes a part of his life.

The genre of this work may be an elegy. Elegy is a sincere lyric [genre of sincere lyricism], where feelings penetrate from the depths of the soul, and the heart becomes sad.

I would like to name another genre - a song. Firstly, the epigraph contains a Tatar folk song, and secondly, the rhythm and rhyme in Tufan's poem correspond to the song. It feels like you are reading, and at the same time, singing".

3. "At first glance, this work is one of the simplest: the lyrical hero appeals to a natural phenomenon. But the wind here is a symbolic image, it conveys one of the most powerful feelings of loneliness. We know that the wind has a destructive force, for the hero the wind is the only thing he owns. But even it does not bring anything good, the wind cannot be a "friend" of the lyrical hero: "Iskən xillər faydasyz". A friend would bring news that his beloved is alive... But the wind does not do this. <...>

In my opinion, the genre of this poem is adjacent to the song. Each line has its own melody, I want to sing them to the whole world. This poem is an expression of the lyrics of the soul (i.e. "sincere lyrics")".

The study confirmed that in the perception of *Russian readers* there was mainly **aesthetic interference**, which transformed the idea of *form, the genre of this poem*. In discussions about its artistic content, features of a **common** with the reception of Tatar readers appeared. It concerned, first of all, the interpretation of the topic of separation from a beloved woman and the motives of loneliness and longing.

More than 80% of the testees (28 people) perceived Tufan's work through the prism of elegy as a genre, which, as you know, took a special place in the history of Russian literature of the 1st half of the 19th century. According to the readers, "the work is filled with sad thoughts about the beloved", it refers to philosophical lyrics and is distinguished by the "melancholy feelings", "personal pain and regret" of the poet. According to their views, the work "has features characteristic of this genre: the motives of disappointment, loneliness, longing."

Consideration of other lyrical genres did not enter the "horizon of expectation" of Russian readers, which undoubtedly distinguished their perception from the reception of representatives of Tatar culture and language.

Conclusions drawn from the experiment

Thus, the *genre experience* of Russian readers and the features of their cultural identity led to the transformation of the content of the poem of the Tatar poet, as well as the emergence of aesthetic interference. In this regard, we see the statement that the reader's original perception of the logical and aesthetic potential of the work of art is not at least due to the peculiarities of his native ethnic culture, ethical attitudes and aesthetic addictions, traditions of the people" (Sigov, 2019, p. 143).

The experiment also confirmed that national identity is found in literary genres, on the one hand. On the other hand, the identity of the readers themselves, their "conjugation" with their native culture and language, contributes to aesthetic interference - a "different" reading of both the content and the form of the work of a foreign author.

Identity and Russian-Tatar translations: methodological aspect

The inclusion into the practice of teacher training for bi- and multilingual schools of the works of foreign writers allows us to create a personality that is able to adequately perceive the cultural traditions of different nations.

A special place in the practice of training subject teachers who are able to work in the Russian-Tatar-English audience is occupied by translated works. For example, when forming ideas about genres that have developed in world literature and which carry a certain historical and cultural context, it is necessary to turn to their consideration in a foreign language artistic context. During the course "Literature of Antiquity, the Middle Ages and Renaissance", which is intended for students of the Tatar philology department, the study of the works of Shakespeare is carried out through Russian and Tatar translations.

Students, as a rule, are familiar with the translations of Shakespeare's sonnets, made by Marshak, because they were considered the most successful ones in the Soviet times. Their analysis allows us to show how the identity of different ethnic groups manifests itself in translated works. In the classroom, students deal with a comparative analysis of the 65th ("Since brass, nor stone, nor earth, nor boundless sea"), the 66th ("Tired with all these, for restful death I cry"), the 130th Shakespeare's sonnets translations into Russian and Tatar languages. Among Russian ones, translations by S.Marshak, B. Pasternak are of great importance, the Tatar translation of sonnets was performed by Sharaf Mudarris.

It is established that in the foreign tradition, the canonicity of the genre is weakening: translators, as a rule, do not convey the stable principle of creating an image of the world that corresponds to the characteristics

of a classical sonnet. This is fully felt in Marshak's translations, where angry Shakespeare's lines were transformed into romantic.

Here is a line from 130th sonnet.

I love to hear her speak, yet well I know

That music hath a far more pleasing sound. [http://www.stratford.ru]

(I like to listen to how she speaks, but I know well / That the music sounds much nicer).

Marshak completely replaces these lines:

Ty ne naydesh v ney sovershennykh linij,

Osobennogo sveta na chele. [http://www.stratford.ru]

Mudarris:

Tynlyym any, lækin anyñ tavvysh-mojy

Muzykadan matur tygel ber dæ menæ (Shakespeare, 1961).

(Slushayu eyje no zvuki eyje golosa / Ne krashe muzyki dlya menya).

Sh. Mudarris, creating a translation oriented to the reader of his native culture, he places the accents in the translation so that concepts that really coincide with the original author's position are "strong".

We believe that the use of examples of different interpretations of the same works of the English poet by representatives of various literatures allows us to form the ability of future language teachers to capture the key concepts and those related to "other" cultural and historical contexts.

Thus, in Tatar literature, the perceiving consciousness tried to conform to the text of Shakespeare, which strengthened the bi-directionality and dialogic nature in revealing the uniqueness of the sonnet. Mudarris's preservation to a greater extent of the features of the original work is largely due to the traditions of the host literature. In Tatar literature, a special place was occupied by the canonical forms of lyrics, such as rubayi, gazelles, kasydy. Their presence, including the history of national literature of the 20th century, did not allow translators to radically change the strict principles of writing sonnets.

Aspects of identity in the study of Russian literature of the XVIII century in a bilingual environment.

The cultural and literary identities of readers appear in the process of studying the literary trends of the 18th century.

The main difficulty for students of pedagogical areas for whom the Tatar language is native[‡], consists in understanding the life features of Russian literature of this period. This is necessary for a deeper and more comprehensive analysis of the works of the 18th century, written in the traditions of classicism and sentimentalism.

Due to the fact that classicism did not receive proper development in Tatar literature, the formation of ideas about this direction is impossible without reference to *Tatar educational literature of the 19th century*. So, the teacher explains the analysis of the poem "The anthem to the Beard" by Lomonosov in a Tatar-speaking audience comparing it with Kandalyi's "Mullah and His Wife", in which the poet chose for satire the method of hidden irony. Lomonosov and Kandalyi are against the vices of the clergy.

The study of their works is also impossible without immersion in historical and cultural contexts. The basis of *differences* in identity in this case is not only the language, but also the facts of history. In the case of the Tatar people this is the lack of statehood.

The purpose of the work of future teachers in a comparative study of these works is to bridge the gaps between different artistic concepts and create a sense of tolerance and mutual respect. A comparative analysis allows us to identify the main difference between the ideology of Tatar enlightenment from the classics in Russian literature.

Lomonosov considers the problem from a state position, which corresponds to the poetics of classicism. A poet and a classicist exposes not only the clergy: in the poem there is a mockery of those, who, having no special advantages, trying to impress the court, gives the appearance of reasonableness (1986).

G. Kandalyi solves the problem in a cultural-educational manner; the Tatar poet does not reach the level of broad generalization, creating a satirical image of the mullah:

Торуп irtə biteң yugach,
Ashyk-poshyk namaz kylgach,
Berur Ashka Baruny Sin
Yazeñə zur bəkhət sanduñ [Kandalyi: <http://www.kitap.net.ru/kandalyi.php>] .
(Vstav rano i umyvshis, svershiv namaz pospeshno, posesheniye obeda vspomnish kak bolshoye schastje).

The work of Kandalyi in form and content diverges from the canons of classicism. First of all, this is manifested in a mixture of lexical strata, a lack of orientation towards the norms of antiquity, and a rejection of political and state goals. Such a feature determines, on the whole, many works of Tatar

[‡] We are talking about students studying in IFMK in "Pedagogical Education. Tatar language and literature and foreign (English) language."

enlighteners, in which specific vices of clergymen were the subject of ridicule: greed, ignorance, and neglect of one's duties.

Appealing to the Tatar educational literature in the study of Russian classicism allows us to highlight topics common to the literature of the Enlightenment, because the ideals of the philosophy of the Enlightenment were close to representatives of various literary trends of the 18th century. Comparison also reveals the uniqueness of national literature. The experience of comparing literature contributes to a more effective formation of the concept of classicism among Tatar students *and their identification with their native culture*. It is assumed that they will be able to implement the gained experience in their own practice of teaching Russian literature in bilingual schools.

Discussion

The most complex and debatable aspect of the topic is the problem of *transcultural identity and its manifestation in the literature*. Transculturalism has become the subject of many studies in literary criticism, philosophy and sociology (Tlstanova, 2008; Khukhuni, 2018), presupposing the simultaneous existence of the subject in different cultures, preserving the imprints of each of them. The works of writers-translators), existing in a non-native language, are well-known. In the methodological aspect, they create objective difficulties in their interpretation among the Russian-Tatar students, as well as foreigners. At the same time, their analysis is of great positive significance: there are concepts and images unusual for the Russian consciousness that enrich the Russian artistic word and language.

Conclusion

Our study confirmed that the consideration of the identity phenomenon, both in a theoretical aspect and for a comparative analysis of Russian and Tatar literature, allows us to form the ideas of future language teachers about the literature plurality of peoples of Russia, as well as to better understand the differences and uniqueness of the world of one literature compared to another. In many ways, this contributes to better assimilation of the principle of cultural identity in the context of a multi-ethnic educational environment.

Thus, an experiment to study the foreign reception of the poem by Kh. Tufan "The Winds are Blowing" showed that aesthetic interference is an objective phenomenon that occurs spontaneously in the minds of ordinary readers and trained readers, which include future language teachers.

It is established that the development of the phenomenon of identity is of great value in the education of teachers for modern schools of the Republic of Tatarstan. Self-identification leads to a more subtle sense of self-identification with the culture and language of the natives.

The study of aspects of cultural and genre identity in the works of Russian and Tatar writers helps future writers to better understand the comparison of literature.

Identity is marked in its way in literary translations, for example, in translations of Shakespeare's sonnets into Russian and Tatar. The use of translations in the training of bilingual students creates the necessary condition for a more thoughtful reading of the "top" works through the prism of different national-artistic consciousness and languages.

Acknowledgements

The reported research was funded by Russian Foundation for Basic Research and the government of the Republic of Tatarstan in the framework of a scientific project No. 18-412-160006.

References

Amineva, V. R. (2017). *Comparative Study of Russian and Tatar Literature: Textbook*. Kazan: Shkola.

Bakhtin, M. M. (1986). *Aesthetic of Word Creative Work*. Moscow: Iskusstvo.

Ibragimov, M. I. (2013). Identity in Literature (based on Tatar poetry of the 20th century). *Philology and Culture*, 1(31), 151-154.

Ibragimov, M. I. (2018). Identity of Russian-Speaking Tatars // *Proceedings of the IV International Scientific and Practical Conference "Bi-, poly-, translanguism and language education" under the auspices of MAPRYAL*, 68-74.

Ibragimov, M. I. (2016). *National Identity: Textbook for Language Teachers*. Kazan: RIC.

Kolyadich, T. M. (2019). Modern national Russian-language literature in the literary context of the XXI century (on the example of the work of Russian-speaking writers of the Republic of Tatarstan), *Science and School*, 3, 23-30.

- Popov, M. K. (2004). *National identity and its reflection on artistic consciousness: a monograph*. Voronezh: Voronezh State University.
- Safiullin, Ya. G. (2010). Literary Identity. *Literature Theory: Dictionary for Students*. Kazan: Izdatelstvo Kazanskogo Universiteta.
- Safiullin, Ya. G. (2010). Comparison of literatures. *Theory of literature: a dictionary for students*. Kazan: Izdatelstvo Kazanskogo Universiteta.
- Sigov, V. G. (2019). Comparison as the most important means of analyzing literary and artistic works, images and phenomena. In K. Sigov, & R.Z. Khayrullin (Eds.), *Multinational Russian Literature: Relevant Aspects of Reception and Interpretation: Collective Monograph*. (pp. 146-166). Moscow: Rusains.
- Sultanov, K. (2007). *From home to the world: ethnonational identity and intercultural dialogue*. Moscow: Nauka.
- Tlstanova, M.V. (2008). *From the philosophy of multiculturalism to the philology of transculture*. Moscow: RUDN.
- Tufan, Kh. (1964). *Selected works*. Kazan: Tatarskoye knizhnoye izdatelstvo.
- Khukhuni, G. T., & Valuytseva, I. I. (2018). Translinguism, Transculturalism and Ethnocultural Identity: Complementarity or Conflict? *Proceedings of the IV International Scientific and Practical Conference "Bi-, poly-, translinguism and language education" under the auspices of MAPRYAL*, 11-19.
- Shakespeare's Sonnets [Electronic resource]. Retrieved from <http://www.stratford.ru/>
- Shakespeare, W. (1961). *Sonets*. Sh. Mudarris, trans.). Kazan: Tatarskoye knizhnoye izdatelstvo. (Original work published, 1609).
- Lomonosov, M. V. (1757). *The Anthem to the Beard*. Retrieved from <https://rvb.ru/18vek/lomonosov/01text/01text/06varia/093.htm>
- Kandalyi, G. *Mullah and His Wife* [online resource]. Retrieved from <http://www.kitap.net.ru/kandalyi.php>

Hall, R. B. (1999). *National Collective Identity: Social Constructs and International Systems*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Brubaker, R., & Cooper, F. (2000). Beyond "Identity." *Theory and Society*, 29, 1–47.

Wagner, P. (2002). Identity and Selfhood as a Problematique. In H. Friese (ed.) *Identities*. New York: Berghahn.