VI International Forum on Teacher Education

Development of Vocational Guidance in the Education System as a Factor of Social Justice in the Conditions of Contemporary Challenges: A Comparative Study

Faina M. Kremen* (a), Sergei A. Kremen (b)

(a), (b) Smolensk State University, 214000, Smolensk (Russia), 4 Przhevalskogo street,
fmkremen@gmail.com

Abstract

Modern challenges set new goals for vocational guidance in the education system: it is important to prepare the future subject of social and professional activity, with competencies that ensure success in various fields. The purpose of the study is the analysis of modern approaches and methods of vocational guidance in the education system as an accompaniment to the professional self-determination of schoolchildren in Russia and abroad. The study is based on a comparison of modern models and approaches to career guidance in different countries (USA, Europe, China, Russia, etc.) in the context of globalization, digitalization, accelerating the pace of change, and increasing uncertainty.

The main empirical method of the research was the content analysis of scientific domestic and foreign scientific publications that reveal the theoretical and applied aspects of vocational guidance (86 publications in total). The categories of analysis were: campaigns, organizational models, subjects, goals, forms, and methods of vocational guidance.

The study showed the presence of both common features and differences. The similarity is found at the theoretical level in understanding the purpose of modern career guidance as a process of supporting students’ professional self-determination, as well as the importance of carrying out this work at all levels of education using practical-oriented forms of work. The features of vocational guidance in developed countries, unlike Russia, include the existence of an organized work system implemented by specialists in the form of educational programs. The study allows us to determine both the positive aspects of the development of vocational guidance in Russia, as well as the shortcomings that need to be addressed.

Keywords: schoolchildren, education system, vocational guidance, personal and professional self-determination, vocational guidance methods, content analysis, social justice.

© 2020 Faina M. Kremen, Sergei A. Kremen
This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY 4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.
Published by Kazan federal university and peer-reviewed under responsibility of IFTE-2020 (VI International Forum on Teacher Education)

* Corresponding author. E-mail: fmkremen@gmail.com
Introduction

Modern society is entering a period of a fundamental transformation in all spheres of life, which will significantly transform the world of professions and the labor market. Rapid technological development, digitalization of production and management processes, expansion of forms of employment, hardly predictable economic changes are already changing the quality and quantity of jobs in various industries, as well as the requirements for personal characteristics of employees. Shortly, new jobs will be characterized by interdisciplinarity, high flexibility, and a combination of diverse, including hybrid skills and professional interests. Due to the rapid development of technology, a one-trajectory career will be replaced by many short tracks, alternating with periods of learning new qualifications (Sergeev et al., 2018). According to the predictions by the US Bureau of Labor Statistics in 2015, young people entering the labor market will change their work during their lives at least 12-15 times (Ginevra et al., 2018). The trajectories of professional development themselves become nonlinear and indefinite, more individualized, and variable (protean) (Savickas et al., 2009).

In such a situation, the risks of vocational maladjustment increase at all stages of professional development, starting with the choice of a professional field of activity. Ignoring modern trends aggravates not only the problem of personal adaptation in a rapidly changing world but also the lack of human resources for the development of an innovative economy.

The younger generation requires special attention. It needs certain guidelines and support for successful personal, social, and professional self-determination. In this regard, support for professional self-determination as a significant component of the overall process of support for self-determination is considered by leading domestic researchers (Blinov et al., 2015) as a necessary and independent element of the educational process along with education and upbringing. In many developed countries (USA, Australia, Hong Kong, Great Britain, Scandinavian countries, etc.) the concepts of guidance and support of social and professional development of personality are implemented in the activities on career guidance of school students, which is singled out in a separate curriculum, which is gradually implemented at different stages of school education (Gysbers & Henderson, 2006).

Purpose and objectives of the study

The purpose of the study is the analysis of modern approaches and methods of vocational guidance in the education system as an accompaniment to the professional self-determination of schoolchildren in Russia and abroad.
Literature review

In the modern world education is one of the key institutions implementing the principles of social justice and equality. Its role is not only to ensure equal access to knowledge for students but also to create circumstances for the successful personal and professional self-determination of the younger generation. This is the main aim of vocational guidance within the education system in a situation of dynamic socio-cultural transformations in the world. In the 21st century, for the successful implementation of this task, the educational institution must actively interact with representatives of the economic sphere, public administration, and civil society, integrate into information and technological processes.

Based on the ideas of humanistic psychology and domestic concepts of support of personal development (Slobodchikov, 2009; Frumin, 1996; Mudrik, 1999 etc.), Chistyakova (2018) considers the pedagogical activity on the support of schoolchildren's self-determination as complex "focused on interaction with schoolchildren to support them in the formation of personal growth, social adaptation, decision making on the chosen professional activity and self-assertion in it". In this process, the internal personal and social and professional needs of the student are reconciled, resulting in an individual's attitude to the professional and labor sphere and a way of self-realization.

However, today, in conditions of transition from an industrial economy to a post-industrial one, the classical models of vocational guidance that determine the correspondence between personal inclinations and abilities and the sphere of professional activity (Parsons, 1909; Klimov 1996) are no longer able to provide a comprehensive understanding of the complexity of the modern labor market and the place of the personality in it, the dynamics of professional development of a person. This is due to qualitative changes in the sphere of labor and employment: new social roles are being developed, and the risk of post-professionalism as an orientation to achieving the desired lifestyle rather than self-development is increasing (Blinov et al., 2015). Mono-professionalism is being replaced by multi-professionalism, which requires a person to possess trans-professional competencies - hard, soft, and digital skills, which are based on meta-professional qualities that determine the productivity of a wide range of activities (self-organization, initiative, adaptability, mobility, etc.) (Zeer & Symanyuk, 2019). The growing dynamics of technological development requires from the employee the ability to forecast and plan their own professional route based on the priority of personal values and meanings rather than to be ready for constant assimilation of new knowledge and skills. Unlike the justified choice of various ready-made alternatives offered by industrial society, the center of the model of professional self-determination in a post-industrial society is the development of an individual set of competencies developed by the subject following their own values, meanings, and capabilities, the person creates a “job for themselves” (Sergeev et al., 2018).
The key issue in the organization of vocational guidance is the problem of correlation of interests of the individual and the needs of the economy. Tolstoguzov (2015) notes the following differences based on the analysis of vocational orientation experience of more than a dozen countries in America, Europe, and Asia. In developing countries, the organization of this activity proceeds from the needs of the economy, which leads to an earlier and more rigid fixation of students' professional preferences. In developed countries, on the contrary, the policy in this area is focused on the interests of the individual: the early start of career guidance combined with deferred self-determination, is more flexible, providing for the possibility of changing the track of professional development.

In foreign theory and practice, career guidance proves the effectiveness of new approaches focused on the development of competencies for independent life building (the theory of career construction (Savickas, 2002, 2005)), which prioritize the personal meaning of work (the protean career attitude (Hall, 2004) and the boundaryless career attitude (Arthur 1994; Arthur and Rousseau 1996), taking into account various factors of uncertainty (Mitchell et al., 1999). A study (Volmer & Spurk, 2011) found a connection between autonomous career management (protean carrier) and subjective career success, while high career mobility showed a high positive correlation with objective characteristics of career success (social status, earnings).

Thus, the key task of vocational guidance as a process of support for professional self-determination is the formation of a full-fledged subject of professional and personal self-determination, who is ready for independent goal-setting, adequate self-awareness, aspiration for self-establishment and self-development (Blinov et al., 2015). The solution to this problem requires a review of the conceptual foundations, methods of organization, approaches, and methods of practical work.

**Methodology**

The main empirical method of the research is the content analysis of domestic and foreign scientific publications that reveal relevant theoretical and applied aspects of vocational guidance in Russia and abroad. Within the framework of content analysis, a scientific text is considered as a product of research activity carried out in a specific socio-environmental context. This type of document contains relevant conceptual ideas and practices used in the field under study. The used method allows not only to qualitatively describe and analyze a certain phenomenon but also to determine its most and least mentioned characteristics by using the quantitative measurement procedure.

Carrying out content analysis is based on the allocation of semantic units of text - categories that reveal the key concepts of the study (Andreeva et al., 2006.)
The categories of analysis were: the social context, ideology, approaches, and organizational models of vocational guidance, goals, subjects, and participants in the process, forms and methods of vocational guidance, the expected result. Since the genre of scientific publication involves the analysis of the phenomenon under study, we took into account the critical context of the mentioned category.

The variety of approaches and points of view, considered aspects of the phenomenon under study as a complex system led to the use of a combination of frequency and non-frequency models of content analysis (Tarshis, 2002). Traditionally, within the framework of frequency content analysis, the frequency of mentioning hotel categories is fixed, expressed in separate text elements (words, word combinations, sentences). Since the content of the articles was devoted to different aspects of the problem under study: conceptual research of theoretical aspects from the pedagogical or psychological point of view, consideration of organizational models, analysis of empirical data, during the analysis subcategories were specified and supplemented. Moreover, the analysis of a separate article did not imply the identification of all categories. Thus, the mention of the category in the text was calculated, which allowed obtaining qualitative and quantitative data on the state and trends of vocational orientation in the education system.

We selected 89 sources (articles in magazines, collective monographs, and collections of thematic conferences) as documents for our study, and among them, 66 were Russian publications and 23 were foreign (in English).

Among domestic publications, only articles from the last 10 years were selected, which is due to the renewed interest in career-oriented activities, which emerged in the 2010s on the part of the authorities, scientific community, educational organizations, and representatives of the economic sector. The authors of several publications are the leading researchers of profile centers of the Federal Institute for Development of Education of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration and Russian Academy of Education (Chistyakova, Rodichev, Pryzhanikov, Sergeev, Blinov, etc.). Besides, publications reflecting the experience of vocational guidance in educational organizations of regions and organizations were selected. All texts of Russian authors are taken from the database of the scientific e-library eLIBRARY.RU, which is the largest Russian information and analytical portal. All articles are published in publications included in the List of peer-reviewed scientific publications (Higher Attestation Commission) or included in the Russian Science Citation Index, which confirms their compliance with the requirements for scientific publications.

Since the vocational guidance system has been successfully functioning abroad in developed countries of North America, Europe, and Asia for a long time, the English-language publications selected for the
research have been dated from the early 2000s to the present day. Texts of scientific articles are taken from scientific e-library JSTOR.org and Gale.com.

Results

In our research, we consider various aspects of career guidance in Russia as compared to foreign countries (USA, Canada, Australia, UK, Germany, France, China, etc.). From 89 publications, 63 (70.8%) consider vocational guidance in Russia and 26 (29.2%) in foreign countries. Most publications (68.5%) mention aspects of the social context. In particular, domestic and foreign texts mention globalization trends or current challenges (35.6%) that are changing the labor market and the world of professions.

Russian publications draw attention to the transition to post-industrial society (42.4%) and highlight its characteristics, in particular the idea of lifelong learning (34.8%). At the same time, a number of articles consider modern Russian society to be multi-structured (19.7%): economic segmentation and socio-cultural diversity of regions allow not only post-industrial and industrial patterns but also traditional ones to coexist in our country, each of which qualitatively determines the specifics of the choice of the future of the younger generation. The authors of some publications consider the problem of personnel training for the needs of the country's or region's economy (15.2%) as the social context for the study of career guidance work.

Features of the organization of vocational guidance are considered in 34.8% of scientific documents, mainly Russian ones, which emphasize the need for interaction between various departments, in particular, education, employment, industry, and economy, as well as various sectors: government, business representatives and the public. Today, building an effective system of vocational guidance work is impossible without the organization of social partnership, both at the intra- and interagency and public-private levels (28.8%). In the context of the establishment of the continuing education system, schools are increasingly interacting in a network form (28.8%) with organizations of professional and higher education, supplementary education, and representatives of employers. In more than a quarter of Russian-language publications (27.3%), the consideration of regional specifics is the most important principle in the organization of vocational guidance work, as it allows to consider and most effectively use all organizational and production resources available in a particular region in training qualified personnel for the local economy. In several regions, educational and production clusters are being created to work in the "school-college/university-production" system. Low level of social mobility of labor resources is a specific feature of Russia in comparison with other countries, where educational and labor migration is a natural phenomenon in the context of globalization. For example, in China, considerable attention is paid to
mastering the English language at school: students are guided toward getting professional education abroad since the Chinese system cannot independently satisfy the needs of the economy (Tolstoguzov, 2015).

The articles note the lack of a unified system of vocational guidance in Russia, which is fixed at the state level, which creates problems of normative and managerial nature at the regional level and causes extremely uneven functioning and development of vocational guidance in the country. In most developed European countries, this activity is a sphere of state regulation (Pryazhnikova, 2016), which determines its subjects and tasks.

At present, the range of guidance subjects has expanded to include not only secondary and vocational education organizations. More and more attention is being paid to the field of supplementary education (14.6%) as an accomplice or independent actor. The authors also refer to corporate vocational guidance (10.1 percent) and private services in this area (7.9%). The latter are usually distinguished by the availability of their own base for the organization of practical activities of students, as well as modern methodological tools and trained personnel. This situation raises doubts about the need to build a system of vocational guidance work around a secondary school, which often lacks both material and technical resources and personnel to carry out all the functions of modern vocational guidance (Kremen, 2012). The most important argument in favor of the school is its position as a social institution that meets the principles of social justice and is able to provide equal conditions for all students to access vocational guidance programs and activities. Today, however, building a system of social and professional development of an individual based on a school should be regulated by the authorities in the context of social partnership and the organization of a wide range of networking.

The consideration of the subjects of vocational guidance also involves the analysis of information about its beneficiaries. In the ideology of the modern model of vocational guidance, a pupil is not an object of influence, but an independent subject participating in forming readiness for professional self-determination (Kremen & Kremen, 2013). In 40.4% of the publications, attention is paid to the continuous step-by-step process of inclusion in vocational guidance from childhood, which is generally consistent with the principle of continuing education. Some articles (8.1%) refer to junior school or even preschool level (e.g. kindergartens with specific courses). 13.5% of the texts specify adolescence and youth (e.g., Zaitseva & Kremen, 2019). In the majority of foreign articles devoted to empirical research, senior pupils or even students act as subjects (52.2%). In addition to students, family, and parents (24.7%) are called as beneficiaries, as significant subjects that need to be involved as full-fledged participants in the career guidance process.
Undoubtedly, the key subject of vocational guidance is its specialist. In Russian publications, a wide variety of options are found, among which there is a tendency to mention organization more often than position. Among the organizations, in addition to educational institutions (28.8%), special centers (7.1%) (State interdepartmental centers, resource centers, employment centers), and new participants (Quantoriums, pre-universities, etc.) are named. Among specialists, teachers (6.1%), psychologists, and consultants (4.5% each) are distinguished. In foreign publications, along with institutions (schools - 34.8% and special centers, agencies - 13%), specialists - teachers (8.7%) and mostly counselors (69.6%) are more often mentioned. The data obtained indicate significant differences in the organization of career guidance: in most foreign countries there are specialized training programs for professional (career counselors), which indicates that the state understands the importance of vocational guidance of students as specially organized and carried out by professionals.

An analysis of the approaches mentioned in Russian sources shows that there is a continuum in the ideology of vocational guidance, at the poles of which the “Influencing” and “Assisting” paradigms are located (25.8%). The key difference between them is the attitude towards the student as an object of influence or a developing subject that needs support and encouragement. “Influencing” vocational guidance is increasingly seen as manipulative when a person chooses a vocational training profile and future field of activity under external influence, whose factors often become the “prestige” of the profession and the needs of the regional economy. Most researchers consider the “influencing” career guidance as inconsistent with today's realities, believe that the lack of internal motivation for the personal basis for choosing a professional path leads to disappointment and a low level of professionalism, which negatively affects both the employee’s personality and the economy. However, in 9% of texts, mainly examining the work experience of specific regions or organizations, assistance in choosing a profession and entering an educational institution are mentioned as the goal of vocational guidance.

The “Assisting” model of vocational guidance is based on the idea of supporting and accompanying the student in the process of his or her formation as a future subject of professional activity, capable of independent planning of educational and professional trajectories.

In foreign publications, the consideration of approaches of vocational guidance is built around the use of classical and new models of vocational guidance. American and European researchers believe that traditional approaches do not ensure the adaptation and success of individuals in modern society. In publications devoted to empirical research (52.2%), various modern models are tested: multicultural, protean, life projection, which allows predicting personal development in conditions of dynamic changes.
According to the understanding of vocational guidance as support for social and professional self-determination, the goal of this process, according to both domestic and foreign authors, is the formation of the subject of activity (43.8%), which is concretized in the formation of meta-competencies or competences of professional self-determination (20.2%). The list of these characteristics may differ in different works, but they are united by the readiness of the individual to plan his life. For example, Zeer & Simanyuk (2019) cite the following set of characteristics: “readiness to predict and plan one's career-orientated actions; to enter into communication with representatives of socio-cultural and professional production environment; to resist manipulative influence; to present oneself on the labor market and educational services; to analyze and interpret the content of general secondary education in the context of educational and professional routes”.

At the same time, the main difference between foreign and domestic vocational guidance systems is that in our system, criteria and indicators for assessing the formation of the results of supporting professional self-determination are only currently being developed (Chistyakova, 2018). In foreign practice, these indicators are usually developed as part of special programs for each level of training.

The preference of goals is determined in turn by the choice of forms and methods of work, which are mentioned in 75.3% of the texts. Along with traditional forms, such as informing (11.2%), diagnostics (13.5%), counseling (12.4%), 49.3% of the works deal with various activating and practice-oriented methods and forms: organization of professional samples (13.5%), project activities (4.5%), interactive technologies (8.9%), participation in contests, provocative methods that develop reflection, career-oriented networking. The data obtained show an understanding of the need to organize activities for the formation of the subjective position of the student. These ideas are considered both at the level of presentation of general methodological positions and in the description of the experience of the regions and individual organizations. Modern ideas about career guidance as a system based on the principles of continuity and succession show the rejection of one-time events in favor of using a set of methods and creating special programs. Another trend is the introduction of Internet technologies both for updating professional diagnostics and vocational information and for creating new interactive environments (Pryazhnikov et al., 2017; Dunwell et al., 2013).

Discussions

Global challenges are changing attitudes towards understanding the essence and organizational aspects of vocational guidance, exacerbating the problem of balancing the interests of individuals and the economy. Attempts to adapt to new conditions increase the risk of adjusting personal and professional development to meet the needs of the economy. However, the current situation has sufficient potential to create conditions
for self-development of an individual, disclosure of his abilities, construction of his own unique trajectory of social and professional development. Today it is human resources that become the main driving force of the economy. The task of science is to determine the regularities of the formation of a subject capable of creative activity, the formation of its value-semantic sphere.

The use of the content analysis method has allowed systematizing the publications of domestic and foreign researchers devoted to various aspects of vocational guidance activities in Russia and abroad, to reveal qualitatively-quantitative parameters of its basic elements, to define a certain schematic framework. We consider the analysis of Internet resources in the sphere of vocational guidance to be a promising direction for further research, which will allow us to consider popular and innovative practices and correlate them with theoretical concepts.

**Conclusion**

The results of our research show that the development of vocational guidance is a global trend around the world. Economically developed countries with established traditions in this area are also improving public policy, developing new approaches, and working methods. In Russia, the vocational guidance system is in the process of formation and its level of development is characterized by significant differentiation by region.

Today, in foreign and Russian studies, the understanding of vocational guidance as an aid in choosing a particular profession and determining the linear career development has been replaced by the approach of considering vocational guidance as an accompaniment of social and professional self-determination and the formation of readiness for self-realization. Thus, in the confrontation between the interests of the individual and the economy, it is the interests of the individual that come forward conceptually. However, considering the practice of vocational guidance in Russia, especially at the regional level, one can observe manipulative trends in the development of students' interest in professions and spheres of activity that are most in-demand in the local labor market.

There are the following similarities in understanding the essence of career guidance in Russia and abroad:

- Vocational guidance work occupies an independent place in the education system;

- Conducting career guidance involves social partnership and takes the form of network cooperation;

- Vocational guidance should be carried out at all stages of education following the principles of consistency and continuity,
- Vocational guidance work is aimed at forming meta-competencies of the subject of social and professional activity;

- The efficiency of vocational guidance work is ensured by the use of a set of methods with the prevalence of practice-oriented forms.

The system of vocational guidance of developed foreign countries differs from Russia in the following:

- Vocational guidance is a part of the national policy, which defines the main guidelines and subjects responsible for its implementation;

- Vocational guidance is carried out within the framework of special education programs and has developed indicators and criteria for evaluating its results;

- Vocational guidance work is provided by specialists with specialized training.

Thus, the successful implementation of vocational guidance work in our country requires a systematic restructuring of its content and organization.

References


